CORRESPONDENCE

of the world’s publications) in 1991 to 1527 (2.28%) in 2001 (Arunachalam et al., to be published).

Such controversies pertaining to growth and decline in publication counts are not new. Years ago, when Margaret Thatcher was the Prime Minister, there was a debate on the decline of British science. The fixed journal set used by John Irvine, Ben Martin and colleagues pointed to a decline, while the dynamic one (DIALOG-version which one would now call the CD-ROM version) used by Loet Leydesdorff pointed to the UK’s publication output remaining steady or even rising slightly. Anderson et al. and Braun et al., among others, joined the debate, which went on till Scientometrics published a special issue on measuring UK science in 1991. Leydesdorff’s position (private commun., dated 28 January 2004) was eventually that the stability of UK science depended very much on the years one included in the time series!

Satyanarayana and Jain refer to the European factor as an ‘innovative alternative’ to the JCR impact factor. Unfortunately, it is restricted to about 520 European biomedical journals (‘to judge European journals under European conditions for European researchers’), says the Vicer website, www.vicer.org/vicer/eurofactor.pdf and is not widely used. As far as I know, the European factor has yet to gain wide acceptance among researchers—even in Europe.


ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS. I am grateful to Gene Garfield, Loet Leydesdorff, Francis Nair, Henry Small, B. Viswanathan and Mike Gould for offering valuable suggestions, and Muthu Madhan and S. M. Shahabuddin of MS Swaminathan Research Foundation for help in preparing the tables.

SUBBIAH ARUNACHALAM

Rajan Apartments,
271, K. B. Dasan Road,
Teynampet, Chennai 600 018, India
e-mail: subbiah_a@yahoo.com

Cautious use of Bt genes in transgenic crops

Insecticidal proteins of Bacillus thuringiensis (Bt) have emerged as the proteins of choice to be expressed in transgenic crops towards an environment-friendly mode of insect pest management in agriculture. Although Bt has been under extensive use as a biopesticide over the past five decades, its efficacy and potential have been realized only recently, because of its effective deployment in transgenic crops. Currently, two transgenic crops, viz. cotton and corn are being cultivated in more than a dozen countries. These crops express different Bt toxins (Table 1).

Efforts are being made in many laboratories in India to develop insect pest-resistant transgenic crops. However, consideration of many issues is warranted before introduction of insecticidal protein genes in various crop species. In this context, the experience knowledge gained in many aspects vis-à-vis Bt cotton cultivation is valuable to evaluate different issues.

Transgenic cotton (Bollgard) expressing Bt-cry1Ac gene is under commercial cultivation since 2002 in India. Bt-Cry1Ac toxin confers protection to cotton which is heavily infested by four lepidopteran pests, viz. cotton bollworm (Helicoverpa armigera), pink bollworm (Pectinophora gossypiella), spotted bollworm (Earias

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Crop</th>
<th>Gene</th>
<th>Target pest</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Commercial</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cotton</td>
<td>cry1Ac</td>
<td>Bullworm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>cry2Ab</td>
<td>Bullworm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corn</td>
<td>cry1Ab</td>
<td>European corn borer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>cry1Ac</td>
<td>European corn borer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>cry9C (discontinued)</td>
<td>European corn borer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>cry9Bb</td>
<td>European corn borer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>cry1F</td>
<td>European corn borer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>southwestern corn borer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>falt armworm and black cutworm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Potato</td>
<td>cry24A (discontinued)</td>
<td>Colorado potato beetle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To become commercial soon</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cotton</td>
<td>cry1Ac + cry2Ab</td>
<td>Bullworm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>cry1Ac + cry1F</td>
<td>Bullworm and fall armworm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Vip3A</td>
<td>Bullworm and fall armworm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corn</td>
<td>cry24Ab/35Ab</td>
<td>Bullworm</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1. Commercial Bt crops and genes expressed by them

Source: http://www.isb.vt.edu/
vitella) and tobacco caterpillar (Spodoptera litura). Cry1Ac is highly toxic to H. armigera and E. vitella, moderately toxic to P. gossypiella and not toxic to S. litura.\(^6\)

There have been many concerns about the efficacy and durability of Cry1Ac toxin expression in Bt-cotton. The major one relates to the development of resistance in insects.

(i) The insecticidal activity of transgenic cotton declines significantly as the plants mature\(^7\) and H. armigera and P. gossypiella are exposed to sub-lethal concentrations of Cry1Ac. This encourages some insects to complete their development late in the season. Their survival would eventually lead to the emergence of resistant insects. Promoters that are active during boll development and reproductive phase are needed to express insecticidal protein genes.

(ii) Cry1Ac is not an ideal toxin to manage pink bollworm. Long-term exposure to Cry1Ac may lead to Bt-resistant pink bollworm, which may also have cross-resistance to Cry1Aa and Cry1Ab toxins.

(iii) Deployment of refugia is an essential component of resistance management.\(^8\) Non-compliance of refugia requirement is a problem in transgenic cultivation (http://www.colostate.edu/programs/lifesciences/TransgenicCrops/news.html#still breaking). Effective monitoring and supervision mechanisms are needed for strict compliance of the refugia guidelines.

(iv) Faster introduction of Bt-crops carrying multiple insecticidal protein genes, preferably with differing modes of action/receptor binding, is imperative.\(^9\) Cotton expressing Cry1Ac, Cry2Aa, Cry1F and Vip3A toxins together will tolerate all the major pests in addition to containing a durable resistance management package.

(v) Avoidance of expressing the same gene (e.g., cry1Ab) in multiple crops (cotton, chickpea, pigeonpea, tomato, sorghum, sunflower, etc.) is necessary. An insect species such as H. armigera, with a high propensity for resistance development, should not be exposed to varying levels of Cry1Ac expression throughout the year, and spread over large tracts of cultivation.

(vi) It is advisable to avoid expressing toxins (e.g., Cry1Ab), which are moderately toxic to pests such as H. armigera. Exposure of H. armigera to such toxins will encourage resistance development and eventually cross-resistance to other Cry1A toxins.

(vii) Strict legal measures should be taken by the government to prevent illegal development and cultivation of Bt-crops (http://www.biotech.info.net/illegal_cotton_India.html). Failure to do so will lead to faster development of resistant insects and loss of a valuable biopesticide.

In working towards the development of insect pest-resistant transgenic crops, the following may be important.

(i) Critical evaluation of the target pest, its biology and susceptibility to a range of insecticidal proteins (Bt and non-Bt sources).

(ii) Selection of two or more effective toxins based on their efficacy, mechanism of action and receptor binding.

(iii) Evaluation of the biosafety of insecticidal proteins.

(iv) Optimization of gene expression as evidenced by studies in model systems like tobacco.

(v) Selection of suitable and effective promoters based on spatial and temporal aspects of insect infestation.


(2) James, C., Global Status of Commercialized Transgenic Crops ISAAA Briefs No. 27, ISAAA, Ithaca, New York, 2002.


Trachycarpus takil Becc. is not a ‘rare’ palm

During our botanical collection programme in July 2003, we noticed a population of palm trees in Quercus\(^2\).\(^2\) forest at Kalamuni pass near the Kalamuni temple. This palm had been a subject of controversy from 1995 to 1996 with regard to its status and type locality.

*Trachycarpus takil* (Figure 1) was then understood to be a rare palm and was placed in the *Red Data Book of Indian plants*.\(^2\) According to the information in this book, this palm grows on mount Takil (misspelled for Thakil) in Kumaon at 2000–2500 m. Rana *et al*.\(^1\) stated that ‘Thakil referred to all palm-like plants, and a part of the hill with an abundance of these palms at one time was named as Thaldar Mountains’, which lies ca 15 km south of Pithoragarh. They concluded Thalke-dar to be the type locality of this palm.

Kulkarni and Pawar\(^6\) reported the type locality of *Trachycarpus takil* to be probably Takal, situated near Kalamuni pass between Kalamuni pass and Munsai (misspelled for Munsyari) in Pithoragarh District of Kumaon Himalayas. They had seen abundant trees of this palm in this area.

---

**P. Ananda Kumar**

National Research Centre for Plant Biotechnology, Indian Agricultural Research Institute, New Delhi 110 012, India

_e-mail: pulometla@hotmail.com_